

## BLACKWELL PHILOSOPHY ANTHOLOGIES

Each volume in this outstanding series provides an authoritative and comprehensive collection of the essential primary readings from philosophy's main fields of study. Designed to complement the *Blackwell Companions to Philosophy* series, each volume represents an unparalleled resource in its own right, and will provide the ideal platform for course use.

- 1 Cottingham: *Western Philosophy: An Anthology*
- 2 Cahoon: *From Modernism to Postmodernism: An Anthology* (expanded second edition)
- 3 LaFollette: *Ethics in Practice: An Anthology* (second edition)
- 4 Goodin and Pettit: *Contemporary Political Philosophy: An Anthology*
- 5 Eze: *African Philosophy: An Anthology*
- 6 McNeill and Feldman: *Continental Philosophy: An Anthology*
- 7 Kim and Sosa: *Metaphysics: An Anthology*
- 8 Lycan: *Mind and Cognition: An Anthology* (second edition)
- 9 Kuhse and Singer: *Bioethics: An Anthology* (second edition)
- 10 Cummins and Cummins: *Minds, Brains, and Computers – The Foundations of Cognitive Science: An Anthology*
- 11 Sosa and Kim: *Epistemology: An Anthology*
- 12 Kearney and Rasmussen: *Continental Aesthetics – Romanticism to Postmodernism: An Anthology*
- 13 Martinich and Sosa: *Analytic Philosophy: An Anthology*
- 14 Jacquette: *Philosophy of Logic: An Anthology*
- 15 Jacquette: *Philosophy of Mathematics: An Anthology*
- 16 Harris, Pratt, and Waters: *American Philosophies: An Anthology*
- 17 Emmanuel and Goold: *Modern Philosophy – From Descartes to Nietzsche: An Anthology*
- 18 Scharff and Dusek: *Philosophy of Technology – The Technological Condition: An Anthology*
- 19 Light and Rolston: *Environmental Ethics: An Anthology*
- 20 Taliaferro and Griffiths: *Philosophy of Religion: An Anthology*
- 21 Lamarque and Olsen: *Aesthetics and the Philosophy of Art – The Analytic Tradition: An Anthology*
- 22 John and Lopes: *Philosophy of Literature – Contemporary and Classic Readings: An Anthology*
- 23 Cudd and Andreasen: *Feminist Theory: A Philosophical Anthology*
- 24 Carroll and Choi: *Philosophy of Film: An Anthology*

# Bioethics An Anthology

Second Edition

Edited by

*Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer*

 **Blackwell  
Publishing**

Editorial material and organization © 2006 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

BLACKWELL PUBLISHING

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA  
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK  
550 Swanston Street, Carlton, Victoria 3053, Australia

The right of Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer to be identified as the Authors of the Editorial Material in this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

First edition published 1999 by Blackwell Publishers Ltd  
This second edition first published 2006 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

4 2007

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Bioethics : an anthology / Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer—2nd ed.  
p.cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4051-2947-3 (hardcover : alk. paper)

ISBN 978-1-4051-2948-0 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Medical ethics. 2. Bioethics. I. Kuhse, Helga. II. Singer, Peter, 1946—

RZ24.B4582 2006

174'.957—dc22

2005029295

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library.

Set in 9 on 11pt Ehrhardt  
by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India  
Printed and bound in Singapore  
by Utopia Press Pte Ltd

The publisher's policy is to use permanent paper from mills that operate a sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured from pulp processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices. Furthermore, the publisher ensures that the text paper and cover board used have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

For further information on  
Blackwell Publishing, visit our website:  
[www.blackwellpublishing.com](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com)

## Contents

Acknowledgments	xii
Introduction	1
<b>Part I Before Birth</b>	<b>9</b>
Introduction	11
<b>Abortion</b>	<b>15</b>
1 Abortion and Health Care Ethics JOHN FINNIS	17
2 Abortion and Infanticide MICHAEL TOOLEY	25
3 A Defense of Abortion JUDITH JARVIS THOMSON	40
4 Why Abortion is Immoral DON MARQUIS	51
<b>Mother-Fetus Conflict</b>	<b>63</b>
5 Are Pregnant Women Fetal Containers? LAURA M. PURDY	65
<b>Part II Issues in Reproduction</b>	<b>77</b>
Introduction	79
<b>Assisted Reproduction</b>	<b>85</b>
6 The McCaughey Septuplets: God's Will or Human Choice? GREGORY E. PENCE	87

Contents

7	Surrogate Mothering: Exploitation or Empowerment? LAURA M. PURDY	90
8	A Response to Purdy SUSAN DODDS AND KAREN JONES	100
9	The Right to Lesbian Parenthood GILLIAN HANSCOMBE	104
10	Rights, Interests, and Possible People DEREK PARFIT	108
<b>Prenatal Screening, Sex Selection, and Cloning</b>		<b>113</b>
11	Genetics and Reproductive Risk: Can Having Children be Immoral? LAURA M. PURDY	115
12	Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion: A Challenge to Practice and Policy ADRIENNE ASCH	122
13	Genetic Technology: A Threat to Deafness RUTH CHADWICK AND MAIRI LEVITT	137
14	Sex Selection: The Case For JULIAN SAVULESCU	145
15	Conception to Obtain Hematopoietic Stem Cells JOHN A. ROBERTSON, JEFFREY P. KAHN, AND JOHN E. WAGNER	150
16	Why We Should Not Permit Embryos to be Selected as Tissue Donors DAVID KING	158
17	The Moral Status of the Cloning of Humans MICHAEL TOOLEY	162
<b>Part III The New Genetics</b>		<b>179</b>
Introduction		181
<b>Gene Therapy and Eugenics</b>		<b>185</b>
18	Questions About Some Uses of Genetic Engineering JONATHAN GLOVER	187
19	Ethical Issues in Manipulating the Human Germ Line MARC LAPPÉ	198
20	The Moral Significance of the Therapy-Enhancement Distinction in Human Genetics DAVID B. RESNIK	209
21	Should We Undertake Genetic Research on Intelligence? AINSLEY NEWSON AND ROBERT WILLIAMSON	219

Contents

<b>Genetic Screening and Counseling</b>		<b>229</b>
22	Lessons from a Dark and Distant Past BENNO MÜLLER-HILL	231
23	Patient Autonomy and Value-Neutrality in Nondirective Genetic Counseling ROBERT WACHBROIT AND DAVID WASSERMAN	237
24	Genetic Dilemmas and the Child's Right to an Open Future DENA S. DAVIS	246
<b>Part IV Life and Death Issues</b>		<b>257</b>
Introduction		259
25	The Sanctity of Life JONATHAN GLOVER	266
26	Declaration on Euthanasia SACRED CONGREGATION FOR THE DOCTRINE OF THE FAITH	276
<b>Killing and Letting Die</b>		<b>281</b>
27	The Morality of Killing: A Traditional View GERMAIN GRISEZ AND JOSEPH M. BOYLE, JR.	283
28	Active and Passive Euthanasia JAMES RACHELS	288
29	Is Killing No Worse Than Letting Die? WINSTON NESBITT	292
30	Why Killing is Not Always Worse – and Sometimes Better – Than Letting Die HELGA KUHSE	297
<b>Severely Disabled Newborns</b>		<b>301</b>
31	When Care Cannot Cure: Medical Problems in Seriously Ill Babies NEIL CAMPBELL	303
32	A Modern Myth: That Letting Die is Not the Intentional Causation of Death HELGA KUHSE	315
33	The Abnormal Child: Moral Dilemmas of Doctors and Parents R. M. HARE	329
34	Right to Life of Handicapped ALISON DAVIS	334
<b>Brain Death</b>		<b>337</b>
35	A Definition of Irreversible Coma REPORT OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE OF THE HARVARD MEDICAL SCHOOL TO EXAMINE THE DEFINITION OF BRAIN DEATH	339

36	Is the Sanctity of Life Ethic Terminally Ill? PETER SINGER	344
<b>Advance Directives</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>355</b></span>		
37	Life Past Reason RONALD DWORKIN	357
38	Dworkin on Dementia: Elegant Theory, Questionable Policy REBECCA DRESSER	365
<b>Voluntary Euthanasia and Medically Assisted Suicide</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>375</b></span>		
39	The Note CHRIS HILL	377
40	When Self-Determination Runs Amok DANIEL CALLAHAN	381
41	When Abstract Moralizing Runs Amok JOHN LACHS	386
42	Listening and Helping to Die: The Dutch Way PIETER ADMIRAAL	391
<b>Part V Resource Allocation</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>399</b></span>		
Introduction <span style="float: right;">401</span>		
<b>Micro-Allocation: Deciding Between Patients</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>405</b></span>		
43	Rescuing Lives: Can't We Count? PAUL T. MENZEL	407
44	The Allocation of Exotic Medical Lifesaving Therapy NICHOLAS RESCHER	410
45	Should Alcoholics Compete Equally for Liver Transplantation? ALVIN H. MOSS AND MARK SIEGLER	421
46	The Value of Life JOHN HARRIS	428
47	How Age Should Matter: Justice as the Basis for Limiting Care to the Elderly ROBERT M. VEATCH	437
<b>Macro-Allocation: Dividing Up the Healthcare Budget</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>449</b></span>		
48	Quality of Life and Resource Allocation MICHAEL LOCKWOOD	451

49	A Lifespan Approach to Health Care NORMAN DANIELS	465
<b>Part VI Organ Donation</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>475</b></span>		
Introduction <span style="float: right;">477</span>		
50	Why Give to Strangers? RICHARD M. TITMUS	479
51	Organ Donation and Retrieval: Whose Body is it Anyway? EIKE-HENNER W. KLUGE	483
52	The Case for Allowing Kidney Sales JANET RADCLIFFE-RICHARDS ET AL.	487
53	The Survival Lottery JOHN HARRIS	491
<b>Part VII Experimentation with Human Subjects</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>497</b></span>		
Introduction <span style="float: right;">499</span>		
<b>Human Subjects</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>503</b></span>		
54	Ethics and Clinical Research HENRY K. BEECHER	505
55	Equipose and the Ethics of Clinical Research BENJAMIN FREEDMAN	513
56	The Patient and the Public Good SAMUEL HELLMAN	520
57	The Morality of Clinical Research: A Case Study TORBJÖRN TÄNNSJÖ	525
58	Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing Countries PETER LURIE AND SIDNEY M. WOLFE	533
59	We're Trying to Help Our Sickest People, Not Exploit Them DANSTAN BAGENDA AND PHILIPPA MUSOKE-MUDIDO	539
<b>Human Embryos – Stem Cells</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>541</b></span>		
60	Question of Respect for Life: What Some [Australian] Members of Parliament Have Said About Embryonic Stem Cell Research in Parliament This Week	543
61	Stem Cells, Sex, and Procreation JOHN HARRIS	545

<b>Part VIII Experimentation with Animals</b>	<b>559</b>
Introduction	561
62 Duties Towards Animals	564
IMMANUEL KANT	
63 A Utilitarian View	566
JEREMY BENTHAM	
64 All Animals are Equal	568
PETER SINGER	
65 Vivisection, Morals and Medicine: An Exchange	578
R. G. FREY AND SIR WILLIAM PATON	
<b>Part IX Ethical Issues in the Practice of Healthcare</b>	<b>589</b>
Introduction	591
<b>Confidentiality</b>	<b>595</b>
66 Confidentiality in Medicine: A Decrepit Concept	597
MARK SIEGLER	
<b>Truth-Telling</b>	<b>601</b>
67 On a Supposed Right to Lie from Altruistic Motives	603
IMMANUEL KANT	
68 Should Doctors Tell the Truth?	605
JOSEPH COLLINS	
69 On Telling Patients the Truth	611
ROGER HIGGS	
<b>Informed Consent and Patient Autonomy</b>	<b>619</b>
70 On Liberty	621
JOHN STUART MILL	
71 From <i>Schloendorff v. New York Hospital</i>	624
JUSTICE BENJAMIN N. CARDOZO	
72 Amputees by Choice	625
CARL ELLIOTT	
73 Abandoning Informed Consent	636
ROBERT M. VEATCH	
74 Rational Desires and the Limitation of Life-Sustaining Treatment	646
JULIAN SAVULESCU	

75 The Doctor-Patient Relationship in Different Cultures	664
RUTH MACKLIN	
<b>Part X Special Issues Facing Nurses</b>	<b>677</b>
Introduction	679
76 Ethical Dilemmas for Nurses: Physicians' Orders Versus Patients' Rights	682
E. JOY KROEGER MAPPES	
77 In Defense of the Traditional Nurse	690
LISA H. NEWTON	
<b>Part XI Ethicists and Ethics Committees</b>	<b>699</b>
Introduction	701
78 When Philosophers Shoot from the Hip	703
JAMES RACHELS	
79 Ethics Consultation as Moral Engagement	707
JONATHAN D. MORENO	
80 Truth or Consequences: The Role of Philosophers in Policy-Making	715
DAN W. BROCK	
81 Should the Decisions of Ethics Committees be Based on Community Values?	719
HETA HÄYRY	
Index	725